

HOW TO DIMINISH THE EFFECTS OF BAD PAST KAMMA

SUTTA STUDY WORKBOOK

Name : _____

Date : _____

Venue : _____

This updated v5.0 published via
SBSmail@yahoogroups.com
April 2016

© Aggacitta Bhikkhu, April 2016

Terms of use: You may copy, reformat, reprint, republish, and redistribute this work (pp1 – 52) in any medium whatsoever, provided that: (1) you only make such copies, etc. available free of charge; (2) you do not change the title or contents; (3) you clearly indicate that any derivatives of this work (including translations) are derived from this source document; and (4) you include the full text of this license in any copies or derivatives of this work. Otherwise, all rights reserved.

Composed by *Aggacitta Bhikkhu*
Layout by *Aggacitta Bhikkhu*
Vetted by *Ariyadhammika Bhikkhu*
English edited by *Looi Sow Fei*

Contents

Workshop Outline	4
Preface	5
Structure of this Workbook	6
The Pāḷi Texts	7
About the English Translations	7
INTRODUCTION	9
PAṬHAMASAÑCETANIKĀ SUTTA (AN 10.217)	9
Volitional (1) (AN 10.217 in NDB)	10
ROOT SUTTA	13
LOṆAKAPALLA SUTTA (AN 3.101)	13
A Lump of Salt (AN 3.100 in NDB)	14
CROSS-REFERENCES	27
WHAT COULD “DEVELOPED IN BODY, ETC.” MEAN?	27
The Greater Discourse to Saccaka (MN 36 in MLDB)	28
Future Perils (AN 5.79 in NDB)	30
Cunda (AN 10.24 in NDB)	36
Bhāradvāja (SN 35.127 in CDB)	38
The Guide (Netti-ppakaraṇaṃ) (paras 534-6, p126)	44
Sense Faculties (AN 6.50 in NDB)	46
A Lump of Salt (AN 3.100 in NDB)	48
Bibliography	51
Source of Pāḷi Text	51
References for the English Translation	51
Abbreviations	51

Workshop Outline

- 1 Introduction: Kamma & Experiencing Its Result
 - 1.1 Discussion Interspersed with Meditation
 - 1.2 Presentation of Findings
 - 1.3 Q & A
 - 1.4 Facilitator's Summary & Conclusion
- 2 Root Sutta: A Lump of Salt
 - 2.1 Discussion Interspersed with Meditation
 - 2.2 Presentation of Findings
 - 2.3 Q & A
 - 2.4 Facilitator's Summary & Conclusion
- 3 Cross-references: What Could "Developed in Mind, etc." Mean?
 - 3.1 Discussion Interspersed with Meditation
 - 3.2 Presentation of Findings
 - 3.3 Q & A
 - 3.4 Facilitator's Summary & Conclusion
- 4 Final Summary and Conclusion
- 5 Sharing Merits, Making Aspirations

Preface

This workbook is designed for a one-day sutta study with meditation workshop. A sutta study workshop was requested by interested Buddhists in Kuching, Sarawak, but its theme and duration are my personal choice.

The subject of kamma is a topic of perennial interest to all Buddhists, yet its scope is wide and its depth profound. After all, didn't the Buddha say that it is one of the four "unthinkables"?

The result of kamma, monks, is unthinkable, not to be thought about; thinking about which one may become partially deranged, distressed.¹

Yet there are many passages in the suttas where the Buddha talks about the workings of kamma and its result. These expositions explain the basic principles of the moral law of cause and effect but do not elaborate on details, such as exactly when and how the results ripen and manifest, which are probably so complex that the Buddha considered them unthinkable.

For this reason, this workshop shall only deal with the principles of kamma and the experiencing of its result and how to diminish the effects of bad past kamma. We shall base our discussions on what we can gather from the Pāli scriptures, with some guidance from the commentaries.

Many, if not most, Buddhists believe that one can perform various rituals in order to cleanse oneself of one's bad past kamma, or at least diminish its effects. This belief is especially prevalent among those

¹ Acinteyya Sutta (AN 4.77), Translation by Aggacitta Bhikkhu

exposed to the cultures of which Buddhism has become an integral part. It is therefore not surprising that the Buddhist practices have been influenced by the folk beliefs and rituals of such cultures. On the other hand, more knowledgeable Buddhists may think that performing more good kamma is a more efficacious countermeasure against bad past kamma.

The purpose of this workbook is to go back to the roots by investigating what the Pāli suttas actually say about this matter.

Structure of this Workbook

The English translation is on the left page while the right page is reserved for important Pāli passages, explanatory notes and for you to write your own notes. Discussion topics are also located on the right page. Due to space and layout considerations, however, there are a few exceptions where an explanatory note is placed at the bottom of the left page.

There are 3 sections in this workbook. The first section, Introduction, comprises an excerpt from one sutta to show the basic principle of kamma and the experiencing of its result. The second section, Root Sutta, contains the English translation of Loṇakapalla Sutta (AN 3.101 in DPR, but AN 3.100 in NDB) which describes how the effects of bad past kamma are diminished. The third section, Cross-references, comprises excerpts from several canonical sources where the terms “developed in body” and “developed in mind” are used. These two important terms are also found in our root sutta, but not explained in the sutta itself. For this reason, I feel that we should investigate their occurrence and usage in other canonical sources in order to get a clearer idea of what they could mean. Then we can evaluate the reliability of the explanations found in the commentaries against what the canon says. This is one of the primary purposes of a sutta study workshop.

However, even more important than mere textual analysis is the practicality of our efforts, discoveries and conclusions: how will they help us interpret the suttas meaningfully so that we can practise effectively to reduce and eventually end suffering? Or put another way: to purify our minds from all forms of inflows, fetters, bonds, tendencies, defilements, etc.?

I hope that we shall all not lose sight of this paramount objective even though we may differ in our opinions and interpretations.

The PāḲi Texts

In order not to bewilder the participants of the workshop who are mostly people with little knowledge of PāḲi, I have only included important passages and terms from the PāḲi texts. The passages are copied from Āyasmā Yuttadhammo's *Digital PāḲi Reader (DPR)* 4.3, pasted and reformatted.

About the English Translations

All the translations, except one, are those of Āyasmā (Bhikkhu) Bodhi, extracted from his works cited at the end of this booklet. In his translation of *Loṇakapalla Sutta*, however, I modified some parts to more accurately reflect the PāḲi phrasing; these are italicised. I have reproduced only the portions of his notes relevant to our workshop, but retained his numbering for the convenience of those who want to further pursue them in his original works. I have also added extra notes based on the commentary to the relevant sutta passage and these are indicated by § instead of numbers.

The translation of the passages from *Nettipakaraṇa* and its commentary are mine, but that of the book title is by Āyasmā Ñāṇamoli. For ease of comparison I have cited the paragraph and page numbers of those passages in his translation instead of using the DPR classifica-

tion which is completely different and accessible only to the Pāli scholar.

I am grateful to Āyasmā Ariyadhammika for proofreading my first draft and giving useful suggestions to improve this workbook. But my special thanks must go to my long-time editor Looi Sow Fei for a thorough polishing of the English.

Aggacitta Bhikkhu

March 2016

1

INTRODUCTION

PAṬHAMASAÑCETANIKA SUTTA
(AN 10.217)

VOLITIONAL (1)

Volitional (1) (AN 10.217 in NDB)

Bhikkhus, I do not say that there is a termination of volitional kamma that has been done and accumulated so long as one has not experienced [its results], and that may be in this very life, or in the [next] rebirth, or on some subsequent occasion. But I do not say that there is making an end of suffering so long as one has not experienced [the results of] volitional kammās that have been done and accumulated.

Paṭhamasañcetanikasuttaṃ (AN 10.217)

nāhaṃ, bhikkhave, sañcetanikānaṃ kammānaṃ katānaṃ upacitānaṃ appaṭisaṃveditvā byantībhāvaṃ vadāmi. tañca kho diṭṭheva dhamme upapajje vā apare vā pariyāye. na ttevāhaṃ, bhikkhave, sañcetanikānaṃ kammānaṃ katānaṃ upacitānaṃ appaṭisaṃveditvā dukkhassantakiriyaṃ vadāmi.

D1. Does “making an end of suffering” refer to the moment of attainment of arahantship (kilesa-parinibbāna), or the physical death of an arahant (khandha-parinibbāna)?

2

ROOT SUTTA

LONAKAPALLA SUTTA
(AN 3.101)

A LUMP OF SALT

A Lump of Salt (AN 3.100 in NDB)

Bhikkhus, if one were to say thus: ‘A person experiences kamma in precisely the same way that he created it,’ in such a case there could be no living of the spiritual life and no opportunity would be seen for completely making an end of suffering.⁵⁴⁶

But if one were to say thus: ‘When a person creates kamma that is to be experienced in a particular way, he experiences its result precisely in that way,’ in such a case the living of the spiritual life is possible and an opportunity is seen for completely making an end of suffering.⁵⁴⁷

Here, bhikkhus, *some person’s trifling bad kamma created (earlier)* leads him to hell, while here *some other person’s identical trifling bad kamma created (earlier)* is to be experienced in this very life, without even a slight [residue] being seen, much less abundant [residue].

What kind of *person’s trifling bad kamma created (earlier)* leads him to hell? Here, some person is undeveloped in body, virtuous behavior, mind, and wisdom; he is limited and has a mean character,⁵⁴⁸ and he dwells in suffering.⁵⁴⁹ *Such a person’s trifling bad kamma created (earlier)* leads him to hell.

⁵⁴⁸ *Paritto appātumo*. Mp explains: “He is limited because of the limitation of his virtues (*parittaguṇo*). His self (*ātumā*) is his body (*attabhāvo*); even though his body may be large, he has a ‘mean character’ because of the limitation of his virtues.” *Ātuma(n)* is an alternative form of *atta(n)* (Skt *ātman*). Mp identifies it with *attabhāva*.

Loṇakapallasuttaṃ (AN 3.101)

yo, bhikkhave, evaṃ vadeyya — ‘yathā yathāyaṃ puriso kammaṃ karoti tathā tathā taṃ paṭisaṃvediyatī’ti, evaṃ santaṃ, bhikkhave, brahmacariyavāso na hoti, okāso na paññāyati sammā dukkhassa antakiriyāya.

yo ca kho, bhikkhave, evaṃ vadeyya — ‘yathā yathā vedanīyaṃ ayaṃ puriso kammaṃ karoti tathā tathāssa vipākaṃ paṭisaṃvediyatī’ti, evaṃ santaṃ, bhikkhave, brahmacariyavāso hoti, okāso paññāyati sammā dukkhassa antakiriyāya.

idha, bhikkhave, ekaccassa puggalassa appamattakampi pāpakammaṃ kataṃ tamenāṃ nirayaṃ upaneti. idha pana, bhikkhave, ekaccassa puggalassa tādisaṃyeva appamattakaṃ pāpakammaṃ kataṃ diṭṭhadhammavedanīyaṃ hoti, nā’ñupi khāyati, kiṃ bahudeva.

kathaṃrūpassa, bhikkhave, puggalassa appamattakampi pāpakammaṃ kataṃ tamenāṃ nirayaṃ upaneti? idha pana, bhikkhave, ekacco puggalo abhāvitakāyo hoti abhāvitasīlo abhāvitacitto abhāvitapañño paritto appātumo appadukkhavihārī. evarūpassa, bhikkhave, puggalassa appamattakampi pāpakammaṃ kataṃ tamenāṃ nirayaṃ upaneti.

⁵⁴⁹ Text reads *appadukkhavihārī*, which does not fit the context well. Mp offers an unconvincing resolution of the compound: “He dwells in suffering because of his small evil deed” (*appakenapi pāpena dukkhavihārī*). The Chinese parallel has nothing corresponding to this against which to check it. I amend the text to read simply *dukkhavihārī*. It is possible that *appa* entered via a recitation error based on *appamāṇavihārī* just below.

What kind of *person's identical trifling bad kamma created (earlier)* is to be experienced in this very life, without even a slight [residue] being seen, much less abundant [residue]? Here, some person is developed in body, virtuous behavior, mind, and wisdom. He is unlimited and has a lofty character, and he dwells without measure.⁵⁵⁰ *Such a person's identical trifling bad kamma created (earlier)* is to be experienced in this very life, without even a slight [residue] being seen, much less abundant [residue].⁵⁵¹ §

(1) Suppose a man would drop a lump of salt into a small bowl of water. What do you think, bhikkhus? Would that lump of salt make the small quantity of water in the bowl⁵⁵² salty and undrinkable?

“Yes, Bhante. For what reason? Because, Bhante, the water in the bowl is limited, thus that lump of salt would make it salty and undrinkable.”

But suppose a man would drop a lump of salt into the river Ganges. What do you think, bhikkhus? Would that lump of salt make the river Ganges become salty and undrinkable?

“No, Bhante. For what reason? Because, Bhante, the river Ganges contains a large volume of water, thus that lump of salt would not make it salty and undrinkable.”

So too, bhikkhus, *here some person's trifling bad kamma created (earlier)* leads him to hell, while *here some other person's identical trifling bad kamma created (earlier)* is to be experienced in this very life, without even a slight [residue] being seen, much less abundant [residue].

kathaṃrūpassa, bhikkhave, puggalassa tādisaṃyeva appamattakaṃ
 pāpakammaṃ kataṃ diṭṭhadhammavedanīyaṃ hoti, nā'ṇupi
 khāyati, kiṃ bahudeva? idha, bhikkhave, ekacco puggalo
 bhāvitakāyo hoti bhāvitasīlo bhāvitacitto bhāvitapañño aparitto
 mahatto appamāṇavihārī. evarūpassa, bhikkhave, puggalassa
 tādisaṃyeva appamattakaṃ pāpakammaṃ kataṃ
 diṭṭhadhammavedanīyaṃ hoti, nā'ṇupi khāyati, kiṃ bahudeva.

⁵⁵⁰ *Aparitto mahattā* (Be: *mahatto*). Mp (Ce): “He is unlimited because his virtues are not limited; even when his body is small, he has ‘a great character’ because of the greatness of his virtues” (*guṇamahantatāya mahattā*). Mp takes all these terms to imply that the person being described is an arahant ...

⁵⁵¹ That is, a residue to be experienced in future lives.

§ The commentary glosses *without even a slight [residue] being seen* as “in the second lifetime (*attabhāva*) it is not seen even slightly, meaning: in the second lifetime it does not give result (*vipākam*) even of a slight measure (*aṇumattampi*)”.

What kind of *person's trifling bad kamma created (earlier)* leads him to hell? Here, some person is undeveloped in body, virtuous behavior, mind, and wisdom; he is limited and has a mean character, and he dwells in suffering. Such a person's trifling bad kamma created (earlier) leads him to hell.

What kind of *person's identical trifling bad kamma created (earlier)* is to be experienced in this very life, without even a slight [residue] being seen, much less abundant [residue]? Here, some person is developed in body, virtuous behavior, mind, and wisdom. He is unlimited and has a lofty character, and he dwells without measure. *Such a person's identical trifling bad kamma created (earlier)* is to be experienced in this very life, without even a slight [residue] being seen, much less abundant [residue].

(2) Here, bhikkhus, someone is imprisoned for [stealing] half a kahāpaṇa, a kahāpaṇa, or a hundred kahāpaṇas,⁵⁵³ while someone else is not imprisoned for [stealing] the same amount of money.

What kind of person is imprisoned for [stealing] half a kahāpaṇa, a kahāpaṇa, or a hundred kahāpaṇas? Here, someone is poor, with little property and wealth. Such a person is imprisoned for [stealing] half a kahāpaṇa, a kahāpaṇa, or a hundred kahāpaṇas.

What kind of person is not imprisoned for [stealing] half a kahāpaṇa, a kahāpaṇa, or a hundred kahāpaṇas? Here, someone is rich, with much money and wealth. Such a person is not imprisoned for [stealing] half a kahāpaṇa, a kahāpaṇa, or a hundred kahāpaṇas.

⁵⁵³ *Kahāpaṇa*. The major unit of currency used in northern India during the Buddha's time.

So too, bhikkhus, *here some person's trifling bad kamma created (earlier)* leads him to hell, while here some other *person's identical trifling bad kamma created (earlier)* is to be experienced in this very life, without even a slight [residue] being seen, much less abundant [residue].

What kind of *person's trifling bad kamma created (earlier)* leads him to hell? Here, some person is undeveloped in body, virtuous behavior, mind, and wisdom; he is limited and has a mean character, and he dwells in suffering. *Such a person's trifling bad kamma created (earlier)* leads him to hell.

What kind of *person's identical trifling bad kamma created (earlier)* is to be experienced in this very life, without even a slight [residue] being seen, much less abundant [residue]? Here, some person is developed in body, virtuous behavior, mind, and wisdom. He is unlimited and has a lofty character, and he dwells without measure. *Such a person's identical trifling bad kamma created (earlier)* is to be experienced in this very life, without even a slight [residue] being seen, much less abundant [residue].

(3) Bhikkhus, take the case of a sheep merchant or butcher, who can execute, imprison, fine, or otherwise penalize someone who has stolen one of his sheep but can't do so to someone else who has stolen his sheep.

What kind of person⁵⁵⁴ can the sheep merchant or butcher execute, imprison, fine, or otherwise penalize for stealing a sheep? One who is poor, with little property and wealth. The sheep merchant or butcher can execute, imprison, fine, or otherwise penalize such a person for stealing a sheep.

What kind of person can't the sheep merchant or butcher execute, imprison, fine, or otherwise penalize for stealing a sheep? One who is rich, with a lot of money and wealth, a king or royal minister. The sheep merchant or butcher can't execute, imprison, fine, or otherwise penalize such a person for stealing a sheep; he can only plead with him: 'Sir, return my sheep or pay me for it.'

So too, *bhikkhus, here some person's trifling bad kamma created (earlier)* leads him to hell, while *here some other person's identical trifling bad kamma created (earlier)* is to be experienced in this very life, without even a slight [residue] being seen, much less abundant [residue].

What kind of *person's trifling bad kamma created (earlier)* leads him to hell? Here, some person is undeveloped in body, virtuous behavior, mind, and wisdom; he is limited and has a mean character, and he dwells in suffering. *Such a person's trifling bad kamma created (earlier)* leads him to hell.

What kind of *person's identical trifling bad kamma created (earlier)* is to be experienced in this very life, without even a slight [residue] being seen, much less abundant [residue]? Here, some person is developed in body, virtuous behavior, mind, and wisdom. He is unlimited and has a lofty character, and he dwells without measure. *Such a person's identical trifling bad kamma created (earlier)* is to be experienced in this very life, without even a slight [residue] being seen, much less abundant [residue].

If, bhikkhus, one were to say thus: 'A person experiences kamma in precisely the same way that he created it,' in such a case there could be no living of the spiritual life and no opportunity would be seen for completely making an end of suffering. But if one were to say thus: 'When a person creates kamma that is to be experienced in a particular way, he experiences its result precisely in that way,' in such a case the living of the spiritual life is possible and an opportunity is seen for completely making an end of suffering."

D2. *After having read through this sutta, what can we learn about how to diminish the effects of bad past kamma? In particular, what is the basic principle governing the ability to diminish the effects of bad past kamma? Give evidence from specific passages in this sutta to support your conclusions.*

3

CROSS-REFERENCES

WHAT COULD “DEVELOPED
IN BODY, ETC.” MEAN?

The Greater Discourse to Saccaka (MN 36 in MLDB)

How, Aggivessana, is one **undeveloped in body** and **undeveloped in mind**? Here, Aggivessana, pleasant feeling arises in an untaught ordinary person. Touched by that pleasant feeling, he lusts after pleasure and continues to lust after pleasure. That pleasant feeling of his ceases. With the cessation of the pleasant feeling, painful feeling arises. Touched by that painful feeling, he sorrows, grieves, and laments, he weeps beating his breast and becomes distraught. When that pleasant feeling has arisen in him, it invades his mind and remains because body is not developed. And when that painful feeling has arisen in him, it invades his mind and remains because mind is not developed. Anyone in whom, in this double manner, arisen pleasant feeling invades his mind and remains because body is not developed, and arisen painful feeling invades his mind and remains because mind is not developed, is thus undeveloped in body because mind is not developed, is thus **undeveloped in body** and **undeveloped in mind**.

And how, Aggivessana, is one **developed in body** and **developed in mind**? Here, Aggivessana, pleasant feeling arises in a well-taught noble disciple. Touched by that pleasant feeling, he does not lust after pleasure or continue to lust after pleasure. That pleasant feeling of his ceases. With the cessation of the pleasant feeling, painful feeling arises. Touched by that painful feeling, he does not sorrow, grieve, and lament, he does not weep beating his breast and become distraught. When that pleasant feeling has arisen in him, it does not invade his mind and remain because body is developed. And when that painful feeling has arisen in him, it does not invade his mind and remain because mind is developed. Anyone in whom, in this

double manner, arisen pleasant feeling does not invade his mind and remain because body is developed, and arisen painful feeling does not invade his mind and remain because mind is developed, is thus **developed in body** and **developed in mind**.³⁸⁴

Future Perils (AN 5.79 in NDB)

Bhikkhus, there are these five future perils as yet unarisen that will arise in the future. You should recognize them and make an effort to abandon them. What five?

In the future, there will be bhikkhus who are **undeveloped in body, virtuous behavior, mind, and wisdom**.¹⁰⁸³ They will give full ordination to others but will not be able to discipline them in the higher virtuous behavior, the higher mind, and the higher wisdom. These [pupils] too will be **undeveloped in body, virtuous behavior, mind, and wisdom**. They in turn will give full ordination to others but will not be able to discipline them in the higher virtuous behavior, the higher mind, and the higher wisdom. These [pupils] too will be **undeveloped in body, virtuous behavior, mind, and wisdom**. Thus, bhikkhus, through corruption of the Dhamma comes corruption of the discipline, and from corruption of the discipline comes corruption of the Dhamma.¹⁰⁸⁴ This is the first future peril as yet unarisen that will arise in the future. You should recognize it and make an effort to abandon it.

Again, in the future there will be bhikkhus who are **undeveloped in body, virtuous behavior, mind, and wisdom**. They will give dependence¹⁰⁸⁵ to others but will not be able to discipline them in the higher virtuous behavior, the higher mind, and the higher

³⁸⁴ MA explains that “development of body” here is insight, and “development of mind” concentration. When the noble disciple experiences pleasant feeling, he does not become overwhelmed by it because, through his development of insight, he understands the feeling to be impermanent, unsatisfactory, and not self; and when he experiences painful feeling, he does not become overwhelmed by it because, through his development of concentration, he is able to escape from it by entering into one of the meditative absorptions.

¹⁰⁸³ Mp does not comment on *abhāvitakāyā*, but Spk II 395,16 glosses it as *abhāvitapañcadvārikakāyā*, “undeveloped in the body of the five sense doors,” probably referring to sense restraint....

¹⁰⁸⁴ Mp: “How is it that when the Dhamma is becoming corrupt, the discipline becomes corrupt? When the dhammas of serenity and insight are no longer being nurtured, the fivefold discipline no longer exists. But when there is no discipline of restraint among those who are immoral, in its absence serenity and insight are not nurtured. In this way, through corruption of the discipline, there is corruption of the Dhamma.” The fivefold discipline by restraint is restraint by virtuous behavior, mindfulness, knowledge, patience, and energy (*sīlasaṃvara*, *satisaṃvara*, *ñāṇasaṃvara*, *khantisaṃvara*, *viriyasaṃvara*). See Ps I 62,23–25, commenting on the Sabbāsava Sutta.

¹⁰⁸⁵ *Nissaya*. A procedure prescribed in the Vinaya by which a junior bhikkhu apprentices himself to a qualified senior bhikkhu, normally his preceptor or teacher. A similar procedure is prescribed for bhikkhunīs. The period of nissaya is normally the first five years after a bhikkhu’s full ordination, but it can be extended in the case of one who needs more time to gain competence....

wisdom. These [pupils] too will be **undeveloped in body, virtuous behavior, mind, and wisdom**. They in turn will give full ordination to others but will not be able to discipline them in the higher virtuous behavior, the higher mind, and the higher wisdom. These [pupils] too will be **undeveloped in body, virtuous behavior, mind, and wisdom**. Thus, bhikkhus, through corruption of the Dhamma comes corruption of the discipline, and from corruption of the discipline comes corruption of the Dhamma. This is the second future peril as yet unarisen that will arise in the future. You should recognize it and make an effort to abandon it.

Again, in the future there will be bhikkhus who are **undeveloped in body, virtuous behavior, mind, and wisdom**. While engaged in talk pertaining to the Dhamma, in questions-and-answers,¹⁰⁸⁶ they will slide down into a dark Dhamma but will not recognize it. Thus, bhikkhus, through corruption of the Dhamma comes corruption of the discipline, and from corruption of the discipline comes corruption of the Dhamma. This is the third future peril as yet unarisen that will arise in the future. You should recognize it and make an effort to abandon it.

Again, in the future there will be bhikkhus who are **undeveloped in body, virtuous behavior, mind, and wisdom**. When those discourses spoken by the Tathāgata are being recited that are deep, deep in meaning, world-transcending, connected with emptiness, they will not want to listen to them, will not lend an ear to them, or apply their minds to understand them; they will not think those teachings should be studied and learned.¹⁰⁸⁷ But when those discourses are being recited that are mere poetry composed by poets, beautiful in words and phrases, created by outsiders, spoken by disciples, they will want to listen to them, lend an ear to them,

¹⁰⁸⁶ ...The “dark Dhamma” ... is said to occur by way of fault-finding with a mind bent on criticizing others.

and apply their minds to understand them; they will think those teachings should be studied and learned. Thus, bhikkhus, through corruption of the Dhamma comes corruption of the discipline, and from corruption of the discipline comes corruption of the Dhamma. This is the fourth future peril as yet unarisen that will arise in the future. You should recognize it and make an effort to abandon it.

Again, in the future there will be bhikkhus who are **undeveloped in body, virtuous behavior, mind, and wisdom**. The elder bhikkhus—being **undeveloped in body, virtuous behavior, mind, and wisdom**—will be luxurious and lax, leaders in backsliding, discarding the duty of solitude; they will not arouse energy for the attainment of the as-yet-unattained, for the achievement of the as-yet-unachieved, for the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. Those in the next generation will follow their example. They, too, will be luxurious and lax, leaders in backsliding, discarding the duty of solitude; they, too, will not arouse energy for the attainment of the as-yet-unattained, for the achievement of the as-yet-unachieved, for the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. Thus, bhikkhus, through corruption of the Dhamma comes corruption of the discipline, and from corruption of the discipline comes corruption of the Dhamma. This is the fifth future peril as yet unarisen that will arise in the future. You should recognize it and make an effort to abandon it.

These, bhikkhus, are the five future perils as yet unarisen that will arise in the future. You should recognize them and make an effort to abandon them.

Cunda (AN 10.24 in NDB)

Friends, making a declaration of development,^s a bhikkhu says: ‘I am **developed in body, virtuous behavior, mind, and wisdom.**’ If, however, greed overcomes that bhikkhu and persists; if hatred ... delusion ... anger ... hostility ... denigration ... insolence ... miserliness ... evil envy ... evil desire overcomes that bhikkhu and persists, he should be understood thus: ‘This venerable one does not understand in such a way that he would have no greed; thus greed overcomes him and persists. This venerable one does not understand in such a way that he would have no hatred ... no evil desire; thus evil desire overcomes him and persists.’ ...

... Suppose a poor, destitute, and needy person claims to be rich, affluent, and wealthy. If, when he wants to buy something, he cannot pay with money, grain, silver, or gold, they would know him as a poor, destitute, and needy person claiming to be rich, affluent, and wealthy. For what reason? Because when he wants to buy something, he cannot pay with money, grain, silver, or gold. So too, friends, ...

Friends, making a declaration of development, a bhikkhu says: ‘I am **developed in body, virtuous behavior, mind, and wisdom.**’ If greed does not overcome that bhikkhu and persist; if hatred ... evil desire does not overcome that bhikkhu and persist, he should be understood thus: ‘This venerable one understands in such a way that he has no greed; thus greed does not overcome him and persist. This venerable one understands in such a way that he has no hatred ... no evil desire; thus evil desire does not overcome him and persist.’ ...

- § The commentary explains that the bhikkhu is making a claim to arahantship.

Suppose a rich, affluent, and wealthy person claims to be rich, affluent, and wealthy. If, when he wants to buy something, he can pay with money, grain, silver, or gold, they would know him as a rich, affluent, and wealthy person who claims to be rich, affluent, and wealthy. For what reason? Because when he wants to buy something, he can pay with money, grain, silver, or gold. So too, friends, ...

Bhāradvāja (SN 35.127 in CDB)

On one occasion the Venerable Piṇḍola Bhāradvāja was dwelling at Kosambī in Ghosita's Park.¹¹⁶ Then King Udena approached the Venerable Piṇḍola Bhāradvāja and exchanged greetings with him.¹¹⁷ When they had concluded their greetings and cordial talk, he sat down to one side and said to him:

“Master Bhāradvāja, what is the cause and reason why these young bhikkhus, lads with black hair, endowed with the blessing of youth, in the prime of life, who have not dallied with sensual pleasures, lead the complete and pure holy life all their lives and maintain it continuously?”¹¹⁸

“Great king, this was said by the Blessed One who knows and sees, the Arahant, the Fully Enlightened One: ‘Come, bhikkhus, towards women old enough to be your mother set up the idea that they are your mother;¹¹⁹ towards those of an age to be your sisters set up the idea that they are your sisters; towards those young enough to be your daughters set up the idea that they are your daughters.’ This is a cause and reason, great king, why these young bhikkhus ... lead the complete and pure holy life all their lives and maintain it continuously.”

“The mind is wanton, Master Bhāradvāja. Sometimes states of lust arise even towards women old enough to be one’s mother; sometimes they arise towards women of an age to be one’s sister; sometimes they arise towards women young enough to be one’s daughter. Is there any other cause and reason why these young bhikkhus ... lead the complete and pure holy life all their lives and maintain it continuously?”

“Great king, this was said by the Blessed One who knows and sees, the Arahant, the Fully Enlightened One: ‘Come, bhikkhus, review this very body upwards from the soles of the feet, downwards from the tips of the hairs, enclosed in skin, as full of many kinds of impurities:¹²⁰ “There are in this body head-hairs, body-hairs, nails, teeth, skin, flesh, sinews, bones, bone-marrow, kidneys, heart, liver, pleura, spleen, lungs, intestines, mesentery, contents of the stomach, excrement, bile, phlegm, pus, blood, sweat, fat, tears, grease, saliva, snot, fluid of the joints, urine.”’ This too, great king, is a cause and reason why these young bhikkhus ... lead the complete and pure holy life all their lives and maintain it continuously.”

“That is easy, Master Bhāradvāja, for those bhikkhus who are **developed in body, developed in virtue, developed in mind, developed in wisdom**. But it is difficult for those bhikkhus who are undeveloped in body,¹²¹ undeveloped in virtue, undeveloped in mind, undeveloped in wisdom. Sometimes, though one thinks, ‘I will attend to the body as foul,’ one beholds it as beautiful. Is there any other cause and reason why these young bhikkhus ... lead the complete and pure holy life all their lives and maintain it continuously?”

¹²¹ *Abhāvitakāyā*. Spk: Undeveloped in the “body” of the five (sense) doors (*abhāvitapañcadvārikakāyā*), i.e., lacking in sense restraint.

“Great king, this was said by the Blessed One who knows and sees, the Arahant, the Fully Enlightened One: ‘Come, bhikkhus, dwell guarding the doors of the sense faculties. Having seen a form with the eye, do not grasp its signs and features. Since, if you leave the eye faculty unguarded, evil unwholesome states of covetousness and displeasure might invade you, practise the way of its restraint, guard the eye faculty, undertake the restraint of the eye faculty. Having heard a sound with the ear... Having smelt an odour with the nose ... Having savoured a taste with the tongue ... Having felt a tactile object with the body ... Having cognized a mental phenomenon with the mind, do not grasp its signs and features. Since, if you leave the mind faculty unguarded, evil unwholesome states of covetousness and displeasure might invade you, practise the way of its restraint, guard the mind faculty, undertake the restraint of the mind faculty.’ This too, great king, is a cause and reason why these young bhikkhus ... lead the complete and pure holy life all their lives and maintain it continuously.”

“It is wonderful, Master Bhāradvāja! It is amazing, Master Bhāradvāja! How well this has been stated by the Blessed One who knows and sees, the Arahant, the Fully Enlightened One. So this is the cause and reason why these young bhikkhus, lads with black hair, endowed with the blessing of youth, in the prime of life, who have not dallied with sensual pleasures, lead the complete and pure holy life all their lives and maintain it continuously.

In my case too, when I enter my harem unguarded in body, speech, and mind,^s without setting up mindfulness, unrestrained in the sense faculties, on that occasion states of lust assail me forcefully. But when I enter my harem guarded in body, speech, and mind, with

- § The commentary explains: One playing with his hands and feet and turning his neck does not guard his body. One speaking lewdly in assorted ways does not guard his speech. One thinking sensual thoughts, etc. does not guard his mind. ... Thus in this sutta three types of body are mentioned: “This very body” refers to the body born of impurity, “developed in body” to the body of the five (sense) doors, and “guarded in body” to the body of movements that express oneself.

mindfulness set up, restrained in the sense faculties, on that occasion states of lust do not assail me in such a way.

“Magnificent, Master Bhāradvāja! Magnificent, Master Bhāradvāja! The Dhamma has been made clear in many ways by Master Bhāradvāja, as though he were turning upright what had been turned upside down, revealing what was hidden, showing the way to one who was lost, or holding up a lamp in the dark for those with eyesight to see forms. Master Bhāradvāja, I go for refuge to the Blessed One, and to the Dhamma, and to the Bhikkhu Saṅgha. From today let Master Bhāradvāja remember me as a lay follower who has gone for refuge for life.”

The Guide (Netti-ppakaraṇaṃ) (paras 534-6, p126)

534. Therein the virtue aggregate and the samādhi aggregate constitute samatha, the wisdom aggregate vipassanā.

535. When one develops samatha-vipassanā two factors of existence (*bhavaṅgāni*)—body and mind (*citta*)—approach development; the way leading to the cessation of existence, the two bases—virtue and samādhi also [approach development]. The bhikkhu is **developed in body, virtue,^s mind and wisdom.**

536. When the body is being developed, two things approach development: right action and right effort. When virtue is being developed, two things approach development: right speech; and right livelihood. When the mind is being developed, two things approach development: right mindfulness and right samādhi. When wisdom is being developed, two things approach development: right view and right thought.

- § The commentary suggests two interpretations of “developed in body and virtue”: (1) fulfilment of the training pertaining to proper conduct and of the training fundamental to the spiritual life, or (2) developed in the body of the five (sense) doors in terms of restraint of the (sense) faculties and developed in the other aspects of virtue (as stipulated in the Vinaya).

Sense Faculties (AN 6.50 in NDB)

Bhikkhus, (1) when there is **restraint of the sense faculties**, for one who exercises restraint over the sense faculties, (2) **virtuous behavior** possesses its proximate cause. When there is virtuous behavior, for one whose behavior is virtuous, (3) **right concentration** possesses its proximate cause. When there is right concentration, for one possessing right concentration, (4) the **knowledge and vision of things as they really are** possesses its proximate cause. When there is the knowledge and vision of things as they really are, for one possessing the knowledge and vision of things as they really are, (5) **disenchantment and dispassion** possess their proximate cause. When there is disenchantment and dispassion, for one possessing disenchantment and dispassion, (6) the **knowledge and vision of liberation** possesses its proximate cause.

A Lump of Salt (AN 3.100 in NDB)

What kind of *person's identical trifling bad kamma created (earlier)* is to be experienced in this very life, without even a slight [residue] being seen, much less abundant [residue]? Here, some person is **developed in body, virtuous behavior, mind, and wisdom.**[§] He is unlimited and has a lofty character, and he dwells without measure.⁵⁵⁰ *Such a person's identical trifling bad kamma created (earlier)* is to be experienced in this very life, without even a slight [residue] being seen, much less abundant [residue].⁵⁵¹

[§] The commentary explains: By “developed in body, etc.” an arahant is shown. For he is said to be developed in body by means of contemplation of the body which is reckoned as body-development. “Developed in virtuous behaviour” means grown in virtuous behaviour. This method (of exegesis) also applies to the remaining two words. Alternatively, he is developed in body by means of development of the five (sense) doors. By this, the virtuous behaviour of sense-restraint is meant; by “developed in virtuous behaviour” the remaining three types of virtuous behaviour (restraint according to the Pātimokkha, purity of livelihood and wise reflection when using requisites) are meant.

D3. *What are the possible meanings of “developed in body” and “developed in mind” that can be inferred from the canonical passages in this section? Cite the specific passages to support your answer and state whether the meanings can be found explicitly or implicitly.*

D4. *What do you think is/are the most appropriate meaning/s of these two terms in the context of our root sutta, A Lump of Salt (AN 3.100)? Give reasons for your answer and specify the passages on which it is based.*

Bibliography

Source of Pāḷi Text

Digital Pali Reader 4.3

References for the English Translation

The Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha: A Translation of the Majjhima Nikāya, translated by Bhikkhu Ñāṇamoli and Bhikkhu Bodhi. Boston: Wisdom Publications, 2005.

The Connected Discourses of the Buddha: A Translation of the Saṃyutta Nikāya, translated by Bhikkhu Bodhi. Boston: Wisdom Publications, 2000.

The Numerical Discourses of the Buddha: A Translation of the Aṅguttara Nikāya, translated by Bhikkhu Bodhi. Boston: Wisdom Publications, 2012.

The Guide (Netti-ppakaraṇaṃ) according to Kaccāna Thera, translated from the Pali by Bhikkhu Ñāṇamoli. London: The Pali Text Society, 1977.

Abbreviations

	Pāḷi Text	Reference according to
AN	Aṅguttara Nikāya	Book number : Sutta number
MN	Majjhima Nikāya	Sutta number
SN	Saṃyutta Nikāya	Saṃyutta number : Sutta number
Nett	Netti-pakaraṇa	Section : Chapter
CBD	The Connected Discourses of the Buddha	
DPR	Digital Pali Reader 4.3	
MLDB	The Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha	
NDB	The Numerical Discourses of the Buddha	

